

## Social Impact Of Revitalization And Pedestrianization In Malioboro, The City Center Of Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Ahmad MUNAWAR

Faculty of Engineering, Gadjah Mada University, Jalan Grafika 2, Sleman, INDONESIA  
munawar@ugm.ac.id

**Article History:** Received: 10 January 2021; Revised: 12 February 2021; Accepted: 27 March 2021;  
Published online: 28 April 2021

**Abstract:** Malioboro street is the oldest and the largest shopping area in Yogyakarta, is situated in the city center of Yogyakarta. As a shopping area, Malioboro Street has not enough facilities to ensure its success. A shopping area must also, and increasingly, depends on safe and pleasant condition for walking about within it. Therefore, Malioboro street should be pedestrianized. This study will clarify the social impact by the project and the opinions from the affected stake holders on the development perspectives of Malioboro Street. The target groups are commercial sectors (hotel owner and shop owner), transportation sectors (parking attendance, pedicab and horse-cart drivers), vendors and community in the surrounding Area. It is then concluded that social impact of revitalization and pedestrianization in Malioboro should be taken into account to ensure its success.

**Keywords:** pedestrianization, social impact, city center, shopping area, revitalization

### 1. Introduction

Malioboro Street, which is the oldest and the largest shopping area in Yogyakarta, is situated in the city center and to the North of Sultan's Palace (see Figure. 1). An old Dutch garrison, Vredeburg, is situated on Malioboro Street near the Post Office. The Planners envisage a national culture center on this historic site, where so much bitter tragedy was enacted. Restoration began in 1980 and the various exhibits will take up residence as space becomes available. Eventually the fort's powder rooms and barracks will house museums, galleries, workshops and concert halls. As a shopping area, Malioboro Street has not enough facilities to ensure its success. A shopping area must also, and increasingly, depend on the reconciliation of three other basic needs - easy road access to centre, safe and pleasant condition for walking about within it and above all, enough space close by for that bulkiest of shopping baskets, the private car.

Furthermore, Malioboro Street is not just a shopping area. It performs the identity of the city's culture which owes a debt to the Yogyakarta Palace. Yogyakarta is still alive as a centre of culture, not just as a site where the remains of previous cultures can be seen.

It is therefore, Malioboro street should be revitalized and pedestrianized. Pedestrianization in the city center has been implemented in many cities in the world such as in Taunton Town Center [1] and Palermo [2]. Social impact of pedestrianization has also been analyzed in Amritsar [3] and in Istanbul [4].

Traffic impact of pedestrianization in Malioboro has also been analysed by Lestarini et al [5]. However, this study has not analyzed the social impact.



“RT” and “RW” (lowest local government). Their job is to manage their citizens who live in their area, also they manage the permanent shops or other commerce which does the activities in their area.

4. Street vendors, which have placed to do commerce along Malioboro, can be divided as:
  - a. Street vendors which are located in front of the permanent shop, open their shop from 10.00 am to 09.00 pm. These groups of sellers sell various things which usually Yogyakarta’s souvenir such as batik, animal’s skin, hand handicrafts, and others.
  - b. Street vendors, which are located others than point a. They have different community group than the community in point a.
  - c. Foods and drinks sellers settle on the sidewalk of Malioboro and area around it and open their shop from 10.00 am to 06.00 pm. Usually they sell “nasi padang”, “rames” ( rice and various side dishes), meat ball, ice, or other foods.
  - d. “Pedagang Makanan Lesehan” (restaurant without chairs in it) opens their restaurants from 09.00 pm to 04.00 am. These “Pedagang lesehan” sell not only “Gudeg” (Yogyakarta traditional food) but also fried chicken and others.
  - e. In the morning, from 05.00 am to 09.00 am, in some places along pedestrian area, there are some food sellers who sell for breakfast such as “gudeg”, “soto” (kind of soup), “lontong opor” (chicken cooked with coconut milk and be eaten with rice steamed in banana leaf), etc.
  - f. “Pedagang Angkringan” (food seller who sells their food in a five legs cart) sells at the day or night and sell foods, rice, drinks. The uniqueness is that the water is being cooked directly in the “gerobak”.
5. Movement sellers (sellers, who have no permanent place). They sell the goods around Malioboro. Usually this kind of seller go out in the morning/ day and sell till night, moving in some spots that the tourists usually exist or some visitors who are taking a rest in the benches, such as :
  - a. Foods and drinks moving seller like sellers of meat ball, “ronde” (traditional drink made from ginger), mineral water, milk, ice cream, siamay (similar with meat ball but without soup in it), etc.
  - b. Cigarette sellers and snacks like, cooked corn and peanut, cake, and many more. In this group, newspaper seller especially in the morning can be included.
  - c. Vegetables seller and cooking ingredients that do commerce from morning till almost day and serve another seller or the owner of the shops or the citizens around Malioboro.
6. Motorized and unmotorized transportation communities and parking community in Malioboro, they are
  - a. Transjogja (kind of bus) which has its own stop area and special ticketing service. Along Malioboro Street there are two bus stops for Transjogja.
  - b. City buses other than Transjogja which can drop or take the passengers everywhere. Some city buses go through Malioboro.
  - c. Taxi, except it serves the passengers from hotels around Malioboro, it also serves the passengers who want to go to Malioboro. Some taxis have their own place to look for passengers such as around Tugu Train Station, Ibis hotel, Malioboro Mall, and also around Beringharjo market. Besides the official taxi, there is also unofficial taxi that usually can be found around Tugu train station which use private car to carry the passengers. Other is “ojek” (using motorbike) that can be found easily around Tugu railway station.
  - d. “Andong” (horse-cart) is a public transportation without engine that is moved by horse(s) and become another attraction for tourists who come to Malioboro. Some “andong” park the cart along the road for slow driving in Ahmad Yani Street and Malioboro Street. Besides, “andong” also can be found in the southern of Beringharjo market. Even it gives another uniqueness and color of Yogyakarta; the existence of “andong” gives some problems such as the feces of the horse and make the traffic become crowded.
  - e. Pedicabs are non-engine public transportation which has the most number of it in Malioboro. There are so many groups of pedicab driver that operate in Malioboro. Besides it serves the tourists to go to the tourism object and the center of souvenir in Yogyakarta, the pedicab also be used as public transportation by Malioboro visitors who their house is near Malioboro and cannot be passed by other public transportation.
  - f. Malioboro parking management. Malioboro visitors come to this area generally by their own vehicle such as car, motorbike and tourist bus. There are some locations that are used as parking areas, i.e.: Abu Bakar Ali and Panembahan Senopati (for tourist buses), along the others for cars, motorcycles, pedicabs and horse-cart.

The parking management is divided into two shifts that are morning to afternoon and afternoon to night. In some malls or shops, they have car parks and they manage the parking area by themselves.

7. Trade groups for service are as follows:
  - a. Money Changer. Two official money changers are placed in front of Inna Garuda Hotel and the unofficial one is situated to the South of Tugu railway station.
  - b. Travel agency.
  - c. Hair and Beauty salon.
  - d. Cars or Motorbike rentals.
8. Trade groups that offer services informally:
  - a. Moving or settle street musician such as Banyumas traditional music. Some of the street musicians are blind.
  - b. Tattoo maker, face sketch and painting, engraving, stamp maker, ring seller, picture frame maker, and many more.
  - c. Group of beggars, vagrants and homeless children that ask money in Malioboro.
9. The elements of Yogyakarta government and institutions that is founded by Yogyakarta government:
  - a. "Unit Pelaksana Teknis Malioboro" or UPT is a unit that manages the Malioboro communities. This unit is a part of Yogyakarta Tourism Agency.
  - b. "Dinas Pengelolaan Pasar" is a unit that manages Beringharjo market which is located in Malioboro.
  - c. "Kelurahan, Rukun Warga (RW) dan Rukun Tetangga (RT)" (office of head of village and the lowest local government) that has its area in Malioboro.
  - d. "Lembaga Pemberdayaan Komunitas Kawasan Malioboro" or LPKKM is a partner of UPT Malioboro that comes from the citizens who live around Malioboro, they are the owner of the shops, street vendors, parking management, transportation, etc.

To simplify the mapping of these activities, the study area is divided into eight blocks of observation, starting from the North (Sotuhern of Railway \Station) and ending to the South ( the Post Office as zero kilometer/

Activities in Malioboro area depends also on the time observed. Therefore, according to the time of the activities, this area is classified into four observation times:

- a. Morning activities (06.00-08.30)

In this time, Malioboro still looks silent. Most of the shops and street vendors are still closed. The activities are mainly dominated by selling some traditional foods such as gudeg (a traditional food made of young jackfruit) and angkringan (food stall selling rice, side dishes and drinks at very cheap prices).

- b. Afternoon activities (11.00-13.00)

The shops and street vendors begin their activities during this time. Parking activity also gives an important role.

- c. Nightfall/Evening activities (16.00-19.00)

The activities at this time are almost the same as the afternoon activities. The little difference is that in the nightfall, the street vendor's place is used for selling foods such as meatball, iced fruit, soups, chicken noodle,\ This place has been used for arranging the foods with lesehan (a place where people can enjoy the food by cross-legged sitting). That is really the special characteristic of Malioboro in the evening.

- d. Midnight activities (23.00-03.00)

There are less activities in Malioboro during this time. At this time, the activities are mainly dominated by food stalls throughout the street. The shops are closed.

After doing preliminary observation, the type of activities in Malioboro is divided into groups according to observation time. This result is then used to describe the stakeholders, who conduct activities in Malioboro. The grouping is based on block and observation time.

The data is then used to make a resume of activities for the whole time. The list is then grouped as follows:

- a. Big shop
- b. Parking
- c. Temporary food seller
- d. Permanent food seller
- e. Mobile seller      a
- f. Street Vendors: Souvenir, Batik
- g. Residential area
- h. Hotel

Depth interview survey was conducted to 150 informants according to the proportion of stake holder on the mapping result of activity, including foreign or domestic visitor/tourist which previously does not belong to the group of activity. Meanwhile for inhabitant, the informants are local leaders, i.e.: Chairman of local authorities around Malioboro.

### 3. Results and discussion

Based on the result of the interview, all of the informants hope and want that Malioboro can be arranged well so that it will be better and can give optimal benefit. In the other hand, all of the informants said about their desire that any problems in Malioboro can be solved and get the best solution that will bring benefit for all. In informants' point of view, the revitalization of Malioboro is something needed and urge to be done. The revitalization is expected can push Malioboro become an area that has advantage and function as the center of economy activities, tourism, culture, and history, also maintain its existence as the icon and characteristic of Yogyakarta.

In the attempts to revitalize Malioboro, there are some important things that have to be noticed. One of the important things that have to be noticed is the development of Malioboro in the future. Lately, Malioboro has some potentions that all of them has chance to be developed such as center of commerce, the aim and tourism site, center of government and offices, and the center of cultural art and heritage.

To see the expectation in doing the revitalization of Malioboro, some questions have been asked to the informants about everything that is needed to be developed in revitalizing Malioboro. From the answers can be known the informants expectation in developing and revitalizing Malioboro in the future.

From the question about whether Malioboro needs to be built another mall or large scale shopping center, most of the informants (79%) disagree, just 21% said agreement about the development of the new mall and large scale shopping center in Malioboro. In developing accommodation facilities such as hotel and apartment, most of the informants also disagree (70%), only 30% said agree about the idea in developing accommodation facilities (hotel and apartment). For the open space for event, 65% of the informants said disagree, just 35% said agreement about it. The approximate reason they refuse the development of Mall or large scale shopping center, open space for event, and also hotel and apartment in Malioboro are because of the limit space in Malioboro and the real condition in Malioboro right now such as traffic jam, the limit of parking area, the existence of the shop vendor and others.

To the question about the development of Event Hall in Malioboro, 74% of the informants said disagree and only 26% said agreement to the idea. The same as before, most of the informants (80%) said showed their refusal if there will be developed cinema and music hall in Malioboro. The agreements of this idea just reach 20% from total of the informants. The approximate reason they refuse the development of event hall or cinema and music hall are relating to the real condition of Malioboro that has problem in traffic jam, the limit of the space also the suitability activities that will be developed with the characteristic of Malioboro itself.

Even now the center of DIY government is taken place in Kepatihan, also the Local Parliament (DPRD) building is placed in Ahmad Yani Street and some offices building also located in Kepatihan, but the answer from most of the informants is disagreement if Malioboro will be developed as the office affairs . From all of the informants, 85% of them said the disagreement if Malioboro will be developed as the office affairs. Only 15% said the agreement. One of the reason that is stated by the informants who said disagreement to the development of Malioboro become the center of office affairs, especially the center of government affairs is because every time the protest happen, always go to the Local Parliament (DPRD) office or Governor office, then go to in front of Gedung Agung (the presidential building in Yogyakarta). This condition is disturbing the traffic, also disturb the commerce and business activities. And the informants who said agreement if Malioboro become the center of

office affairs stated that it can support the center of commerce and business in Yogyakarta and make Malioboro as the central business district.

About the question in developing Malioboro as the tourism site, most of the informants gave their answer that supports the revitalization. Being approximated because Malioboro has been the aim and tourism site for domestic and foreign tourists. From the question about the need to develop Tourist Information Center in Malioboro, most of the informants said their agreement (66%), and 34% said disagreement. It shows that the existence of Tourist Information Center is the expectation from most of the informants. Also the development of Tourist Map and Information Board for Tourist, most of the informants (69%) said the agreement, only 31% said the disagreement. It strengthens the fact that the developments which can support Malioboro as the aim and tourism site become the expectation from the informants.

The expectation of Malioboro as the area which are comfortable and safe to be made as public space can be seen from the expectation of most informants to make Malioboro as open area, green, clean, and hospitable, 65% of the informants said the need to develop Malioboro as Stop-place with Bench so that the visitor can enjoy the atmosphere and take a rest after done the activities in that area. But, 35% of the informants showed disagreement. Besides the development of the Stop-off Place with Bench, most of the informants also said the agreement if there is a development of Green Space and Swale Place. From total of the informants, 72% said the agreement about the More Planting (Green Space) and Swale Place. And 28% showed the disagreement. For the informants who said the agreement, they felt that Malioboro is less cool and seems dry. With the intense activities and also the traffic jam, but the limit of the space, the number of park and its quality are minimum, so it is easier to be understood why most of the informants want Malioboro become green area also hospitable and comfort area.

For other facilities, some informants' hopes are the management of the traffic, increase the police patrol, representative parking area, attach CCTV to monitor the safety, add more garbage bins and public toilet especially at night there should be a guard there but for free, add other mosques, the public transportation that is allowed to go to Malioboro just one kind of transportation but the number of it should be more, information center, for example to announce lost child in Malioboro, a road for sellers in Malioboro, semi-permanent building for the sellers, organize the vagrants and beggars, library or reading center for citizens, the organization of horse cart's parking area, the utilization road for difable, theme park for children and also special public transportation for tourists from parking area.

FGD (Focus Group Discussion) for Commercial and resident group is followed by the owner of hotels, hotels' manager, Malls' managements, community figure, local leader, and the owner of permanent shops in Malioboro. Some findings from FGD are:

- a. In FGD participants' point of view and this resident group, Malioboro is very relevant to be developed as tourism site. Besides there is already having tourism attraction, also there have had some supporting facilities such as hotels, shopping center, souvenir shops, and the uniqueness of Malioboro itself such as historical buildings, horse-carts, pedicabs, food and shop vendors that sell characteristic souvenir of Yogyakarta.
- b. Even so, attempts in developing is needed to support Malioboro as tourism site, especially for domestic tourists who are students that do not use hotels or inns as the place to stay, many of them using public toilet and the toilet of Masjid Gedhe Yogyakarta (mosque) as a place to take a bath. It will be better if the government provides stop by place for tourists, it will be even better if the place in around Malioboro with a lower fee and can give services for the tourists or visitors who will use this stop by place. To support the tourism site, tourism information center and any activities that happen in Malioboro is needed so every visitor can know any event that exist and kinds of things also shops that sell those things.
- c. To support the development of tourism site, the characteristic atmosphere of old Yogyakarta should be lifted such as the real art of Yogyakarta. The development of performance place that can shows Yogyakarta's art such as Ramayana dance is needed so the tourist do not have to go to another location to see the performance.
- d. In closing Malioboro Street for such activities for example carnival or art parade should be considered so the traffic that goes to Malioboro can be changed. It is so lose out for the sellers in Malioboro, in addition if the events take place or the same as holiday, week end, or peak season which generally many visitors will go to Malioboro.
- e. Pedicab and horse-cart should be kept as tourism transportation in Malioboro, but there should be an arrangement in the side of number, parking location and also the fee. It should avoid for those driver to increase the fee that in the end will disturb the goodwill of Yogyakarta as tourism site. The same act also for the food and shop vendors, especially food vendors that often put a different price from the price in the list.
- f. The number of shop vendors should be limited and rearranged, if it is possible, the seller that stay behind the shop should be moved somewhere in Malioboro, if possible in Indra ex-cinema, in the western of Beringharjo market. Many shop vendors bring their cart to show their goods and also some that just using the cart to carry their goods so there are so many carts in this area and disturb the pedestrian and the beauty of Malioboro. The seller

that exist there, the goods should be arranged well, they should not use improper tent because it disturb the beauty of Malioboro also the organization of liquid waste so it will not cause bad smell.

g. The cleanness and beauty of Malioboro is not maximal yet, the facts are that there are so many garbages, the number of garbage bin is still minimum, lack of the officer in charge, adding another toilet because it is lack of toilet and the condition is not good. The park should be taken care and added, adding another bench and another supporting facility. The comfortness should be increased, the existence of the street musician give uncomforness, in addition the children beggar that improper and impolite. Besides, the existence of beggars and vagrants need to be arranged. The safety in Malioboro is quite good but the involvement of the communities should be increased so can give the safety and comfortness to the visitors.

h. In the citizens' and community figures' point of view, the communication and coordination between the citizens who live around Malioboro and the sellers in Malioboro have not good yet. The citizens feel that the existence of Malioboro does not give many positive contribution but they get many negative effects, such as noisy, traffic jam and uncomfortable. Even, they worried if one day Malioboro become more developing, the origin will only become the spectator or even step aside or drag out from the area without any benefit they get.

i. If Malioboro will be developed becomes pedestrian area, it should be considered about parking (cars and motorbike), the arrangement of pedestrian side, the arrangement of the shop vendors pedicabs, horse-cart, and also the traffic that is allowed to go through in pedestrian area.

j. Perceive the opinions, responses, and hopes of FGD participants for commercial and residents group.

#### 4. Conclusions

##### Conclusions

1. Malioboro development will be directed at the tourism development, history, culture and trade. Malioboro development cannot be separated from the development of the Monument to the Sultan's Palace Theatre. Revitalization efforts in planning the development of Malioboro Mall or supermarkets, building movie theater, convention center or open stage arena which require vast land are lack of support from the community. In one hand, the provision of infrastructure supporting tourism and supporting comfort and beauty of Malioboro got a great of community support.

2. Office development around Malioboro began less deemed appropriate. It carries a high social burden for tourism and trade activities, especially if there is political activity involving government agencies (local parliament, and governor). There is a discourse of the government to move the office area from Malioboro.

3. Arrangement of traffic in the area of Malioboro is currently not optimal. It still raises many problems such as high traffic density, congestion on the miraculous dots and at the peak of the visit, plus the low awareness of road users to travel.

4. The existence of pedicabs and cart-horses will be retained, but it needs to be organized in terms of number, and the parking lot.

5. Motorcycle and car parking in the area of Malioboro has now reached the maximum limit. Limitations of the existing land led to the difficulty of the arrangement. In addition, high density makes pedestrians felt uncomfortable. Parking becomes a living interpreter parking lot.

6. In spite of being an icon and unique Malioboro, sidewalk vendors, both of whose sell souvenirs, food and otherwise, their existence at Malioboro have reached saturation point. Arrangement in the form of removal or relocation is not easy to do, land occupied by hawkers who have become an economic asset, can be sold or transferred in the control of another party.

7. Cleanliness, comfort, security in the region have not been optimized. Trash is still a matter of hygiene; lack of parks, support facilities is still strongly felt by visitors of Malioboro. The existence of beggars, street children, illegal buckers create an atmosphere become less convenient for tourists and visitors. Level of awareness of trafficking is still low that makes pedestrian felt anxiety.

8. The existence of UPT gives a positive contribution, through a synergy with the container as LPKMM stakeholder, in creating a better Malioboro.

9. The initial color of the physical environment of Malioboro Street and its surroundings seen from different components of their environment;

10. The initial activity of the administration of the construction of the Program is to mobilize equipments including heavy equipments, building materials, piles of materials for the administration of developing site and other stuffs related to construction may generate various physical environmental effects/

##### Recommendations

1. As a tourist area, development of Malioboro is realized by the strengthening the supporting facilities, the arrangement of activities and capacity building, and business culture that is able to provide traction and excellent service for tourists. The existence of a historic building, socio-cultural life of Yogyakarta should be the content from socio-cultural planning along with the physical arrangement of Malioboro. Commercial area developments are directed to build synergy between businesses, large-scale, medium and small.

2. If the plan to transfer governmental offices is realized, it still remains to be Kepatihan building and the establishment of cultural heritage and the surrounding land, and buildings should be studied further.

3. Arrangement of traffic is directed to limit the traffic flow entering the Malioboro. Public transportations are allowed to enter Malioboro in requirement that have been selected. This action has to be done in order to contribute optimally, giving the best service, minimum level of air pollution, and support the development of the area as a tourist area of Malioboro.

4. Pedicabs and cart-horses operations in Malioboro must be registered and receive card of operating permit at Malioboro. It divided in shifts according to a specific time. The organization / community of pedicabs and horse play an active role in the enforcement of this rule together with the relevant agencies. The existence of pedicabs and horse as a means of tourist transport is realized through the optimal service delivery. This action will lead to be arrangement of tariffs which make tourists feel comfortable but still provide a livelihood for these transportation businesses. To avoid poor service delivery, adoption rates are not reasonable.

5. Pockets of new parking should be pursued to reduce the density at Malioboro. As if new parking lot is built, its operation should involve current staff to minimize turbulence and resistance. Parking rates will be raised to give encouragement to people not to use private cars or motorcycles, but to switch it to public transportation passes Malioboro.

6. Arrangement of street vendors has to be conducted by limiting the number of hawkers association located around Malioboro by conducting the registration through the involving hawkers association and giving authorizes to the association to do validation and establishment of a legitimate hawkers association and to be allowed to operate around Malioboro.

7. Supporting facilities of tourism needs to be added, information board and other facilities need to be developed as needed. Plus cleaners, who have cleaning responsibilities on every businessman in Malioboro should be emphasized. Business involvement in Malioboro in creating comfort, security of the region need to be upgraded and are realized by optimizing the "jogoboro" by security agency done by business actors in the region. Vagrants, street children, illegal buckers have to be disciplined by involving community of artists and community of Malioboro.

8. Implementation of Malioboro Revitalization Program may generate various physical environmental effects. Therefore along the program action, stakeholders have to prepare some instruments for reducing physical environmental effects, e.g. the increase of dust and the amount of pollutant in the air, the increase of garbage effect, the groundwater decline effect, and the increase upon rainwater run-off on the soil surface effect.

### **Acknowledgements**

I would like to give my sincere thanks to Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Gadjah Mada University for giving the financial support of this research

### **References**

1. S Melia and T Calvert (2020), *Disappearing Traffic? An Evaluation of Pedestrianisation in Taunton Town Centre*, Project Report of the University of West of England.
2. JS Schussel, (2019), *Experimenting in Palermo: The pedestrianisation of its historical centre*, University of Porto, Dissertation
3. Singh, H. and Sohi, R.S. (2018), *Socio-Economic Effect of Pedestrianisation of Commercial Street into Ambit – Case Study of Pedestrian Path from Car Parking up to Golden Temple Amritsar, Punjab*. *International Journal of Research and Analytical Reviews*, 5(4),18-21
4. HH Demir and I Cacioglu (2016), *Evaluation of Environmental and Social Impacts of Pedestrianization in Urban Historical Areas: Istanbul Historical Peninsula Case Study*, *Journal of Traffic and Logistic Engineering*,4(1), 83-87
5. W Lestarini, W., A Munawar, A., Z Irawan (2019), *The Use of Transport Modeling to Evaluate the Implementation of Pedestrianization in Malioboro Area, Yogyakarta*, *Advances in Engineering Research*, Volume 187. 107-112